## RESEARCH ARTICLE | OCTOBER 24 2024

## **Impact of classical statistics on thermal conductivity predictions of BAs and diamond using machine learning molecular dynamics**

[Hao Zhou](javascript:;) <sup>®</sup>; [Shuxiang Zhou](javascript:;) <sup>®</sup>[;](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5029-1251) [Zilong Hua](javascript:;) <sup>®</sup>; [Kaustubh Bawane](javascript:;) <sup>®</sup>; [Tianli Feng](javascript:;) <sup>s</sup>

Check for updates

*Appl. Phys. Lett.* 125, 172202 (2024) <https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0238592>



## **Articles You May Be Interested In**

[MLIP-3: Active learning on atomic environments with moment tensor potentials](https://pubs.aip.org/aip/jcp/article/159/8/084112/2908187/MLIP-3-Active-learning-on-atomic-environments-with)

*J. Chem. Phys.* (August 2023)

[Machine-learning-derived thermal conductivity of two-dimensional TiS](https://pubs.aip.org/aip/aml/article/2/3/036115/3314263/Machine-learning-derived-thermal-conductivity-of) $_2$ /MoS $_2$  van der Waals heterostructures

*APL Mach. Learn.* (September 2024)

[Machine learning interatomic potentials as efficient tools for obtaining reasonable phonon dispersions and](https://pubs.aip.org/aip/apl/article/123/15/152201/2915836/Machine-learning-interatomic-potentials-as) accurate thermal conductivity: A case study of typical two-dimensional materials

*Appl. Phys. Lett.* (October 2023)

24 October 2024 15:22:45

24 October 2024 15:22:45





X Zurich<br> **S** Instruments





**Export Citation** 

# Impact of classical statistics on thermal conductivity predictions of BAs and diamond using machine learning molecular dynamics

Cite as: Appl. Phys. Lett. 125, 172202 (2024); doi: [10.1063/5.0238592](https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0238592) Submitted: 12 September 2024 . Accepted: 13 October 2024 . Published Online: 24 October 2024

Hao Zhou,<sup>1</sup> Shuxiang Zhou,<sup>2</sup> sand a Kaustubh Bawane,<sup>2</sup> and Tianli Feng<sup>1,a)</sup> and Tianli Feng<sup>1,a)</sup>

## AFFILIATIONS

<sup>[1](#page-5-0)</sup>Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah 84112, USA [2](#page-5-0) Idaho National Laboratory, Idaho Falls, Idaho 83415, USA

[a\)](#page-5-0) Author to whom correspondence should be addressed: [tianli.feng@utah.edu](mailto:tianli.feng@utah.edu)

## ABSTRACT

Machine learning interatomic potentials (MLIPs) have greatly enhanced molecular dynamics (MD) simulations, achieving near-firstprinciples accuracy in thermal conductivity studies. In this work, we reveal that this accuracy, observed in BAs and diamond at sub-Debye temperatures, stems from an accidental error cancelation: classical statistics overestimates specific heat while underestimating phonon lifetimes, balancing out in thermal conductivity predictions. However, this balance is disrupted when isotopes are introduced, leading MLIPbased MD to significantly underpredict thermal conductivity compared to experiments and quantum statistics-based Boltzmann transport equation. This discrepancy arises not from classical statistics affecting phonon–isotope scattering rates but from its impact on the interplay between phonon–isotope and phonon–phonon scattering in the normal scattering-dominated BAs and diamond. This work underscores the limitations of MLIP-based MD for thermal conductivity studies at sub-Debye temperatures.

Published under an exclusive license by AIP Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0238592>

The emergence of machine learning interatomic potentials (MLIPs) has significantly advanced molecular dynamics (MD) simulations. $1,2$  By leveraging first-principles calculations as input, MLIPs are able to describe the interatomic interactions at a near-first-principles accuracy. This accuracy extends from the second-order to the third-and even fourth-order force constants.<sup>[3](#page-5-0)</sup> Naturally, MLIP-based MD (MLMD) has emerged as a powerful method to simulate thermal transport in materials, achieving significantly higher accuracy in ther-mal conductivity prediction than empirical interatomic potentials.<sup>[4](#page-6-0)</sup> For materials that are challenging to fit with empirical interatomic potentials, MLIPs are even more indispensable.

Surprisingly, it has been extensively shown that MLMD can predict the thermal conductivity accurately even at sub-Debye temperatures, when the classical statistics in MD deviate significantly from quantum statistics. For instance, for Si,  $\beta$ -Ga<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>,  $\circ$  cubic BAs,  $\degree$  and diamond,<sup>7</sup> which have Debye temperatures of around  $635,870,9$  $635,870,9$  $635,870,9$  $635,870,9$  $680$ ,<sup>10</sup> and 2240 K,<sup>[11](#page-6-0)</sup> respectively, the thermal conductivities predicted by MLMD using different MLIPs all closely match the experimental data at 300 K. Therefore, some work even suggested that quantum correction (QC) is unnecessary for predicting the thermal conductivities when using MLIPs. $6^{5/7}$  However, this claim lacks a solid foundation. The role of classical statistics in MLMD for predicting thermal conductivity at sub-Debye temperatures remains unclear.

In this Letter, we investigate the impact of statistics on thermal conductivity predictions in MLMD. BAs and diamond are selected for study for three reasons. (1) As the first and second highest thermal conductivity materials in nature, BAs and diamond hold great potential for next-generation electronics. (2) BAs and diamond have been extensively studied in the literature by using both DFT and MD, providing ample data for comparison. (3) With high Debye temperatures, BAs and diamond are ideal candidates for studying the effects of classical statistics at sub-Debye temperatures. Here, both pure and isotopecontained BAs and diamond are studied. The moment tensor potential  $(MTP)^{12}$  is selected owing to its efficiency, reliability, and simplicity. Green–Kubo theory<sup>[13,14](#page-6-0)</sup> is used to extract the thermal conductivity of materials based on the autocorrelation function of heat current from MD simulations. The size effect of Green–Kubo MD is minimal since it uses periodic boundary conditions, which allow long mean-free-path phonons (theoretically infinite long) to transport.<sup>15,[16](#page-6-0)</sup> Phonon spectral energy density  $(SED)^{17}$  analysis is performed based on MD trajectories to extract phonon scattering rates. For reference, Boltzmann transport equation (BTE) calculations are performed with three- and fourphonon (3ph, 4ph) scattering rates obtained from density functional theory (DFT). Phonon–isotope scattering is calculated by using the Tamura formula based on Fermi's Gold rule. All the simulation details can be found in the [supplementary material](https://doi.org/10.60893/figshare.apl.c.7491894) and our previous work.<sup>[18](#page-6-0)</sup>

MTPs are trained for isotope-free and isotope-mixed BAs and diamond. The accuracy of MTPs is demonstrated by comparing the predicted forces and energies with DFT calculations as shown in Fig. 1 and [supplementary material](https://doi.org/10.60893/figshare.apl.c.7491894) Figs. S1 and S2. The root mean square error (RMSE) of energies and forces for BAs are 0.144 meV/atom and  $0.017 \text{ eV/A}$ , respectively, and  $0.060 \text{ meV/atom}$  and  $0.010 \text{ eV/A}$  for diamond, respectively. The phonon dispersions calculated using MTP and DFT agree with each other, as shown in Figs.  $1(c)$  and  $1(f)$ , demonstrating the accuracy of MTPs.

The thermal conductivities of BAs and diamond calculated using MLMD are shown in [Fig. 2.](#page-3-0) Without isotopes, the temperaturedependent thermal conductivities of both materials agree well with those calculated from DFT, being consistent with the literature.<sup>[7](#page-6-0)</sup> However, when isotopes are present, while the DFT calculations agree excellently with experiment, $19-25$  $19-25$  MLMD significantly underpredicts the thermal conductivity of both materials. For example, for isotopically pure BAs, DFT and MLMD yield 1500 and 1300W/mK, respectively, closely matching experimental data  $(1500 \text{ W/mK})$ .<sup>22</sup> For isotopically pure diamond, DFT and MLMD yield 3500 and 3400W/mK, also aligning with experimental data (3300 W/mK).<sup>[23](#page-6-0)-[25](#page-6-0)</sup> However, for natural BAs, the MLMD result (760 W/mK) is significantly lower than both DFT (1300 W/mK) and experimental data (1300 W/mK). Similarly, for natural diamond, the MLMD result (1500 W/mK) is much lower than DFT (2300 W/mK) and experimental data (2400 W/mK).

To investigate why MLMD predicts thermal conductivities well without isotopes but inaccurately with isotopes, we look into phonon specific heat and lifetime. [Figures 3\(a\)](#page-4-0) and [3\(d\)](#page-4-0) show  $\kappa_{\text{MLMD}}/\kappa_{\text{DFT}}$ ,  $c_{\text{MLMD}}/c_{\text{DFT}}$ , and  $\tau_{\text{MLMD}}/\tau_{\text{DFT}}$  for isotopically pure BAs and diamond, respectively, where  $\kappa$  is thermal conductivity, c is specific heat, and  $\tau$  is phonon lifetime. Here,  $\tau_{\text{MLMD}}/\tau_{\text{DFT}}$  is indirectly obtained by using  $\tau_{\text{MLMD}}/\tau_{\text{DFT}} = \kappa_{\text{MLMD}}/\kappa_{\text{DFT}} \cdot c_{\text{DFT}}/c_{\text{MLMD}}$ . It is seen that MLMD overestimates specific heat and underestimates phonon lifetimes significantly, especially at low temperatures. These two errors accidentally cancel each other out, resulting in an apparently accurate thermal conductivity prediction. The errors gradually shrink and disappear as temperature increases. Additionally, the error cancellation is materialdependent. For instance, it is more effective in diamond than in BAs.

In addition to the phonon lifetime ratio ( $\tau_{\rm MIMD}/\tau_{\rm DFT}$ ) that is derived indirectly from thermal conductivity and specific heat, the mode-dependent  $\tau_\mathrm{MLMD}$  and  $\tau_\mathrm{DFT}$  are directly extracted and compared with each other, as shown in Figs.  $3(b)$  and  $3(e)$ . Indeed, MLMD significantly underestimates the lifetime compared to DFT, supporting the error-cancelation claim and the observation in Figs.  $3(a)$  and  $3(d)$ . Furthermore, it is seen that the phonon lifetime underestimation in MLMD is more prominent for lower frequency phonons. This is surprising since classical statistics deviate from quantum statistics relatively smaller for lower frequency phonons than for higher frequency phonons. We hypothesize that these lower frequency phonons, despite having smaller statistics-induced errors, may scatter significantly with higher frequency phonons, which have larger statistics-induced errors. This can also be seen by replacing the quantum phonon population  $(n<sub>O</sub>)$  in the 3,4-phonon scattering formalism with the classical population  $(n<sub>C</sub>)$ , as shown in [Figs. 3\(b\)](#page-4-0) and [3\(e\).](#page-4-0) However, it is noted that



FIG. 1. Validation of MTP machine learning potentials for (a)–(c) BAs and (d)–(f) diamond. (a) and (d) Comparison between energies calculated from MTP and DFT. (b) and (e) Comparison of forces. (c) and (f) Comparison of phonon dispersions.

## <span id="page-3-0"></span>Applied Physics Letters ARTICLE <pubs.aip.org/aip/apl>



FIG. 2. (a) Temperature-dependent thermal conductivity of isotope-free BAs calculated by using DFT  $(3 + 4ph)$  and MLMD (without quantum correction). (b) Isotope concentration-dependent room-temperature thermal conductivity of BAs calculated by DFT  $(3 + 4ph)$  and MLMD (without quantum correction) compared to experimental data. (c) and (d) The same as (a) and (b) but for diamond. References of experimental data in (b): Kang et al.,<sup>[21](#page-6-0)</sup> Li et al.,<sup>[19](#page-6-0)</sup> Tian et al.,<sup>[20](#page-6-0)</sup> Hou et al.,<sup>[22](#page-6-0)</sup> and in (c): Anthony and Banholzer, $23$  Onn et al., $^{24}$  $^{24}$  $^{24}$  and Olson et al. $^{25}$  $^{25}$  $^{25}$ 

replacing  $n_{\text{Q}}$  with  $n_{\text{C}}$  in phonon scattering formalism is not a scientific way to obtain phonon lifetime under classical statistics. This is because the phonon scattering formalism is derived based on  $n<sub>O</sub>$ . Without  $n<sub>O</sub>$ , the phonon scattering formalism is not valid anymore.<sup>[26](#page-6-0)–[30](#page-6-0)</sup> Actually, since  $n_{\text{C}}$  is larger than  $n_{\text{Q}}$  by 0.5 at the classical limit, replacing  $n_{\text{Q}}$ with  $n<sub>C</sub> - 0.5$  in the phonon scattering formalism can yield better thermal conductivity than using  $n_c$  (see the [supplementary material](https://doi.org/10.60893/figshare.apl.c.7491894) Fig. S3).

To eliminate the errors caused by classical statistics, quantum corrections, if possible, need to be done on both specific heat and phonon scattering rate. The discussion of quantum corrections has a long history. In early years, QC was done by correcting the temperature, via equating the total energies of classical and quantum systems,<sup>31-[33](#page-6-0)</sup> i.e.,  $\sum E_{\rm C} n_{\rm C} = \sum E_{\rm Q} n_{\rm Q}$ . While many early studies used this QC method, it was demonstrated to be unreasonable by Turney and McGaughey in  $2009^{27}$  $2009^{27}$  $2009^{27}$  no matter the zero-point energy is considered or not. They used anharmonic lattice dynamics with Stillinger–Weber potential to self-consistently demonstrate this by replacing the  $n<sub>O</sub>$  with  $n<sub>C</sub>$ -1/2. They also found that both specific heat and lifetime were affected by the statistics, and thus QC should be performed on both. In addition, QC should be applied on a mode level instead of a system level. Despite the discovery of Turney and McGaughey, QC has been pri-marily applied to specific heat only.<sup>34–[39](#page-6-0)</sup> On the one hand, QC to lifetime is difficult and remains unfeasible, while that to specific heat is simple. On the other hand, it is found that the QC to lifetime is only important for crystalline materials.<sup>[26,34,35,40](#page-6-0)</sup> QC to specific heat is sufficient for strongly disordered systems where phonon–phonon scattering is not dominant. Gu et  $al^{26}$  $al^{26}$  $al^{26}$  also mentioned in their review paper that QC should be applied to both specific heat and lifetime for crystals, but these two factors often cancel out each other, making the overall impact not strong, such as in graphene and silicon. However, the two factors were not canceled out in the 1D material, carbon nano-tubes, as studied by Barbalinardo et al.<sup>[40](#page-6-0)</sup> They limit  $\hbar$  to zero to approach classical limit in solving the BTE, and a large gap is found between the thermal conductivity obtained using  $n_{\text{O}}$  and  $n_{\text{C}}$ . Puligheddu et al.<sup>[28](#page-6-0)</sup> found, using classical potentials, that the phonon lifetimes of MgO and PbTe obtained by replacing  $n<sub>O</sub>$  with  $n<sub>C</sub>$  in BTE agree well with those obtained from MD with SED analysis, ending with the conclusion that phonon lifetime can be corrected by correcting the phonon population. This finding does not hold in the systems studied in this work (i.e., BAs and diamond), where we find that replacing  $n<sub>O</sub>$  with  $n<sub>C</sub>$  in BTE results in unphysical results that cannot match with MD. In light of these efforts, here we explore several possible quantum correction methods for mode-level phonon lifetime, shown in Figs.  $3(c)$  and  $3(f)$ . Based on the three-phonon scattering formalism, phonon scattering rate is generally proportional to phonon population at high temperatures. Therefore, the first trial to correct  $\tau$  is to use  $n_{\rm C}/n_{\rm Q}$ , which, however, is found to not match with  $\tau_{\rm MLMD}^{-1}/n_{\rm Q}$  $\tau_{\text{DFT}}^{-1}$ . Considering the three-phonon scattering contains  $(1+n)$  and  $(1+2 n)$  terms, the second trial is to use  $(1 + n<sub>C</sub>)/(1 + n<sub>Q</sub>)$  and  $(1+2n_C)/(1+2n_Q)$  for corrections, which are found to not match with  $\tau_{\text{MLMD}}^{-1}/\tau_{\text{DFT}}^{-1}$  either. Other trials, like using  $E_{\text{C}}/E_{\text{Q}}$  and  $c_{\text{C}}/c_{\text{Q}}$ , all fail. It is found that  $\tau$  is overpredicted by classical statistics more for lower frequency phonons, but all these corrections correct less lower

<span id="page-4-0"></span>

FIG. 3. Comparison between quantum and classical statistics-predicted thermal properties of (a)–(c) BAs and (b)–(d) diamond. (a) and (d) Ratios of thermal conductivity, total specific heat, and effective phonon lifetime obtained from MLMD and DFT as a function of temperature. (b) and (e) Mode-level phonon scattering rates at room temperature. (c) and (f) Possible quantum corrections for mode-level phonon scattering rates.

frequency phonons. These indicate that the quantum correction to phonon–phonon scattering rate is complex and is unlikely to be achieved in a straightforward manner.

After understanding the isotope-free materials, we explore the reasons for the significant underestimation of thermal conductivity by MLMD when isotopes are present. Theoretically, the phonon–isotope scattering rate ( $\tau_{ph-iso}^{-1}$ ) should not depend on phonon population, based on the derivation of Tamura's formula using perturbation theory.<sup>41</sup> Numerically, this is verified by comparing the  $\tau_{\text{ph}-\text{iso}}^{-1}$  calculated<br>by Tamura's formula  $(\tau_{\text{ph}-\text{iso}}^{-1} = \pi/2 \cdot \omega^2 g \cdot \text{pDOS})$  and  $\tau_{\text{ph}-\text{iso}}^{-1} = \tau_{\text{tot}}^{-1} - \tau_{\text{ph}-\text{ph}}^{-1}$  obtained by SED analysi phonon frequency, g factor is determined by isotope mass and concentration, pDOS is the projected density of state, and  $\tau_{\rm tot}^{-1}$  and  $\tau_{\rm ph-ph}^{-1}$  are the phonon linewidths in isotope-contained and isotope-free materials, respectively. As seen in [Figs. 4\(a\)](#page-5-0) and [4\(b\)](#page-5-0),  $\tau_{\text{ph-iso}}^{-1}$  obtained from the two methods agree with each other, supporting that  $\tau_{\text{ph-iso}}^{-1}$  does not depend on phonon statistics. We note that some negative  $\tau_{\text{ph$ obtained by  $\tau_{ph-iso}^{-1} = \tau_{tot}^{-1} - \tau_{ph-ph}^{-1}$  are due to the large uncertainty of SED analysis, especially when  $\tau_{tot}^{-1}$  and  $\tau_{ph-ph}^{-1}$  are very close. The  $\tau_{\text{ph-iso}}^{-1}$  obtained by Tamura's formula using classical and quantum statistics also agree with each other for an artificial isotope abundance of BAs as shown in [Fig. 4\(c\)](#page-5-0). Another evidence is temperature dependence. It is found that  $\tau_{\text{ph}-\text{iso}}^{-1}$  does not depend on temperature in MLMD, indicating that  $\tau_{ph}^{-1}$  is invariant on phonon population.

Since  $\tau_{ph}^{-1}$  is larger in MLMD than DFT, adding the same  $\tau_{ph-iso}^{-1}$  is expected to generate smaller impact in MLMD, resulting in larger thermal conductivity in MLMD than DFT. However, the fact is that MLMD shows smaller thermal conductivity than DFT for isotopecontained materials. A possible reason is that the isotopes do not only introduce phonon–isotope scattering but also change the original phonon–phonon scattering. This can be realized by the hydrodynamical behavior of phonons in BAs and diamond. In these two materials, the moment-conserved normal scattering dominates over the momentunconserved Umklapp scattering, resulting in hydrodynamical movement of phonons.<sup>29,42</sup> Therefore, the single-mode relaxation time approximation (SMRTA) fails in describing thermal transport in BAs and diamond. The exact solution of BTE using iteration shows much higher thermal conductivity than SMRTA. Even though phonon statistics do not change  $\tau_{\text{ph}-\text{iso}}^{-1}$  in SMRTA, it changes how normal scattering is coupled with Umklapp scattering in the iteration in solving BTE. As seen in [Fig. 5](#page-5-0), using classical statistics gives a much smaller increase in thermal conductivity after iteration than using quantum statistics. This is understandable since isotope scattering is preferable for high energy phonons and gives positive feedback to Umklapp scattering and increases the resistance. Consequently, the role of statistics becomes more complicated when a material is dominated by normal scattering processes.

In conclusion, we investigate the effects of phonon statistics on the thermal conductivity prediction of BAs and diamond using MLMD. We find that while MLMD, without any quantum correction, can well reproduce the thermal conductivity of isotopically pure BAs and diamond, it is an error-canceling effect: the classical statistics in MLMD overestimates specific heat and underestimates phonon

24 October 2024 15:22:45

24 October 2024 15:22:45

<span id="page-5-0"></span>

FIG. 4. Phonon–isotope scattering rates obtained from SED based on MLMD and Tamura formula for natural abundant (a) BAs, (b) diamond, and (c) BAs with artificial isotope abundance.



FIG. 5. Normalized thermal conductivity of isotopically mixed (a) BAs and (b) diamond with natural abundance obtained in ShengBTE at 300 K as a function of iteration step.

lifetime. This error-canceling effect is disrupted when isotopes are introduced, leading MLMD to significantly underpredict thermal conductivity compared to experiments and quantum statistics-based BTE. This discrepancy is not because classical statistics changes phonon–isotope scattering rates, but because the isotopes change phonon–phonon scattering mechanisms. Additionally, our results support the validity of the Tamura formula for phonon–isotope scattering. We hope this study provides a deeper understanding of thermal conductivity in MLMD simulations.

See the [supplementary material](https://doi.org/10.60893/figshare.apl.c.7491894) for the following: Sec. S1: machine learning interatomic potential simulation details; Sec. S2: Green–Kubo molecular dynamics simulation details; Sec. S3: phonon spectral energy density analysis details; Sec. S4: first principles calculations; Figs. S1 and S2: validation of MTPs; and Fig. S3: temperaturedependent thermal conductivity of BAs and diamond obtained by solving Boltzmann transport equation using different statistics.

This work is supported by the INL Laboratory Directed Research and Development (LDRD) Program under DOE Idaho Operations Office Contract DE-AC07-05ID14517, LDRD Project ID 23A1070- 064FP. H.Z. and T.F. also acknowledge the support from the National Science Foundation (NSF) (Award No. CBET 2212830). The computation used the Center for High Performance Computing (CHPC) at the University of Utah, Bridges-2 at Pittsburgh Supercomputing Center through allocation PHY220002 from the Advanced Cyberinfrastructure Coordination Ecosystem: Services & Support (ACCESS) program, which is supported by NSF Grant Nos. 2138259, 2138286, 2138307, 2137603, and 2138296, and Idaho National Laboratory's High Performance Computing systems located at the Collaborative Computing Center and supported by the Office of Nuclear Energy of the U.S. Department of Energy and the Nuclear Science User Facilities under Contract No. DE-AC07-05ID14517.

## AUTHOR DECLARATIONS Conflict of Interest

The authors have no conflicts to disclose.

### Author Contributions

Hao Zhou: Data curation (equal); Formal analysis (equal); Investigation (equal); Writing – original draft (equal). Shuxiang Zhou: Conceptualization (equal); Funding acquisition (equal); Resources (equal); Writing – review & editing (equal). Zilong Hua: Conceptualization (equal); Funding acquisition (equal); Writing – review & editing (equal). Kaustubh Bawane: Conceptualization (equal); Funding acquisition (equal); Writing – review & editing (equal). Tianli Feng: Conceptualization (equal); Formal analysis (equal); Funding acquisition (equal); Methodology (equal); Resources (equal); Supervision (equal); Writing – review & editing (equal).

#### DATA AVAILABILITY

The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

#### REFERENCES

<sup>1</sup>B. Mortazavi, X. Zhuang, T. Rabczuk, and A. V. Shapeev, "Atomistic modeling of the mechanical properties: The rise of machine learning interatomic potentials," [Mater. Horiz.](https://doi.org/10.1039/D3MH00125C) <sup>10</sup>(6), 1956–1968 (2023). <sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup>Y. Luo, M. Li, H. Yuan, H. Liu, and Y. Fang, "Predicting lattice thermal conductivity via machine learning: A mini review," [npj Comput. Mater.](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41524-023-00964-2) 9(1), 4 (2023).<br><sup>3</sup>Z. Liu, X. Yang, B. Zhang, and W. Li, "High thermal conductivity of wurtzite

boron arsenide predicted by including four-phonon scattering with machine learning potential," [ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces](https://doi.org/10.1021/acsami.1c11595) 13(45), 53409–<sup>53415</sup> (2021).

- <span id="page-6-0"></span><sup>4</sup>X. Qian and R. Yang, "Machine learning for predicting thermal transport prop-
- erties of solids," [Mater. Sci. Eng. R](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mser.2021.100642) 146, 100642 (2021).<br><sup>5</sup>X. Qian, S. Peng, X. Li, Y. Wei, and R. Yang, "Thermal conductivity modeling using machine learning potentials: Application to crystalline and amorphous silicon," [Mater. Today Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mtphys.2019.100140) 10, 100140 (2019).
- R. Li, Z. Liu, A. Rohskopf, K. Gordiz, A. Henry, E. Lee, and T. Luo, "A deep neural network interatomic potential for studying thermal conductivity of  $\beta$ -Ga<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>," [Appl. Phys. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0025051) 117(15), 152102 (2020).
- Y. Ouyang, C. Yu, J. He, P. Jiang, W. Ren, and J. Chen, "Accurate description of high-order phonon anharmonicity and lattice thermal conductivity from molecular dynamics simulations with machine learning potential," [Phys. Rev.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.105.115202) [B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.105.115202) 105(11), 115202 (2022).
- P. H. Keesom and G. Seidel, "Specific heat of germanium and silicon at low
- temperatures," [Phys. Rev.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRev.113.33) 113(1), 33-39 (1959).<br><sup>9</sup>H. He, M. A. Blanco, and R. Pandey, "Electronic and thermodynamic proper-
- ties of  $\beta$ -Ga<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>," [Appl. Phys. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.2218046) **88**(26), 261904 (2006). <sup>10</sup>K. Yaddanapudi, "Ab initio calculations of the thermal properties of boron arse-
- nide," [Comput. Mater. Sci.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.commatsci.2020.109887) 184, 109887 (2020).<br><sup>11</sup>T. Tohei, A. Kuwabara, F. Oba, and I. Tanaka, "Debye temperature and stiffness of carbon and boron nitride polymorphs from first principles calculations,"
- [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.73.064304) 73(6), 064304 (2006). <sup>12</sup>A. V. Shapeev, "Moment tensor potentials: A class of systematically improvable interatomic potentials," Multiscale Model. Simul. 14(3), 1153-1173 (2016).
- $13M$ . S. Green, "Markoff random processes and the statistical mechanics of timedependent phenomena. II. Irreversible processes in fluids," [J. Chem. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1740082)
- 22(3), 398–413 (1954).  $14R$ . Kubo, "Statistical-mechanical theory of irreversible processes. I. General theory and simple applications to magnetic and conduction problems," [J. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1143/JPSJ.12.570)
- [Soc. Jpn.](https://doi.org/10.1143/JPSJ.12.570) <sup>12</sup>(6), 570–586 (1957). <sup>15</sup>Z. Wang and X. Ruan, "On the domain size effect of thermal conductivities from equilibrium and nonequilibrium molecular dynamics simulations," J. Appl. Phys. 121(4), 044301 (2017).
- <sup>16</sup>Z. Fan, L. F. C. Pereira, H.-Q. Wang, J.-C. Zheng, D. Donadio, and A. Harju, "Force and heat current formulas for many-body potentials in molecular dynamics simulations with applications to thermal conductivity calculations,"
- [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.92.094301)  $92(9)$ , 094301 (2015). 17J. A. Thomas, J. E. Turney, R. M. Iutzi, C. H. Amon, and A. J. H. McGaughey, "Predicting phonon dispersion relations and lifetimes from the spectral energy
- density," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.81.081411)  $81(8)$ , 081411 (2010).<br><sup>18</sup>H. Zhou, J. Tiwari, and T. Feng, "Understanding the flat thermal conductivity
- of La<sub>2</sub>Zr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub> at ultrahigh temperatures," [Phys. Rev. Mater.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevMaterials.8.043804) **8**(4), 043804 (2024). <sup>19</sup>S. Li, Q. Zheng, Y. Lv, X. Liu, X. Wang, P. Y. Huang, D. G. Cahill, and B. Lv, "High thermal conductivity in cubic boron arsenide crystals," [Science](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aat8982)
- <sup>361</sup>(6402), 579–581 (2018). <sup>20</sup>F. Tian, B. Song, X. Chen, N. K. Ravichandran, Y. Lv, K. Chen, S. Sullivan, J. Kim, Y. Zhou, T. H. Liu, M. Goni, Z. Ding, J. Sun, G. A. G. U. Gamage, H. Sun, H. Ziyaee, S. Huyan, L. Deng, J. Zhou, A. J. Schmidt, S. Chen, C. W. Chu, P. Y. Huang, D. Broido, L. Shi, G. Chen, and Z. Ren, "Unusual high thermal conduc-
- tivity in boron arsenide bulk crystals," [Science](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aat7932) 361(6402), 582–585 (2018).<br><sup>21</sup>J. S. Kang, M. Li, H. Wu, H. Nguyen, and Y. Hu, "Experimental observation of high thermal conductivity in boron arsenide," [Science](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aat5522) 361(6402), 575-578 (2018).
- <sup>22</sup>S. Hou, F. Pan, X. Shi, Z. E. Nataj, and F. Kargar, "Ultrahigh thermal conductivity of cubic boron arsenide with an unexpectedly strong temperature depen-<br>dence."  $a\overline{x}$
- 23T. R. Anthony and W. F. Banholzer, "Properties of diamond with varying isotopic composition," [Diam. Relat. Mater.](https://doi.org/10.1016/0925-9635(92)90197-V) 1(5–6), 717–726 (1992).
- <sup>24</sup>D. G. Onn, A. Witek, Y. Z. Qiu, T. R. Anthony, and W. F. Banholzer, "Some aspects of the thermal conductivity of isotopically enriched diamond single
- crystals," [Phys. Rev. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.68.2806) **68**(18), 2806–2809 (1992).<br><sup>25</sup>J. R. Olson, R. O. Pohl, J. W. Vandersande, A. Zoltan, T. R. Anthony, and W. F. Banholzer, "Thermal conductivity of diamond between 170 and 1200 K and the isotope effect," Phys. Rev. B 47(22), 14850-14856 (1993).
- <sup>26</sup>X. Gu, Z. Fan, and H. Bao, "Thermal conductivity prediction by atomistic simulation methods: Recent advances and detailed comparison," [J. Appl. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0069175)
- $130(21),\,210902$  (2021). <br> 27J. E. Turney, A. J. H. McGaughey, and C. H. Amon, "Assessing the applicability of quantum corrections to classical thermal conductivity predictions," [Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.79.224305)
- [Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.79.224305) 79(22), 224305 (2009).  $28M$ . Puligheddu, Y. Xia, M. Chan, and G. Galli, "Computational prediction of lattice thermal conductivity: A comparison of molecular dynamics and Boltzmann transport approaches," Phys. Rev. Mater. 3(8), 085401 (2019).
- 29<sub>T</sub>. Feng and X. Ruan, "Quantum mechanical prediction of four-phonon scatter-ing rates and reduced thermal conductivity of solids," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.93.045202) 93(4), 045202 (2016).
- 30<sub>T.</sub> Feng and X. Ruan, "Prediction of spectral phonon mean free path and thermal conductivity with applications to thermoelectrics and thermal manage-
- ment: A review," [J. Nanomater.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/206370) 2014, 206370.<br><sup>31</sup>C. Z. Wang, C. T. Chan, and K. M. Ho, "Tight-binding molecular-dynamics study of phonon anharmonic effects in silicon and diamond," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.42.11276)
- 42(17), 11276–11283 (1990).  $32\gamma$ . H. Lee, R. Biswas, C. M. Soukoulis, C. Z. Wang, C. T. Chan, and K. M. Ho, "Molecular-dynamics simulation of thermal conductivity in amorphous sili-
- con," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.43.6573) 43(8), 6573–6580 (1991).  $33T$ . Feng, B. Qiu, and X. Ruan, "Anharmonicity and necessity of phonon eigen-vectors in the phonon normal mode analysis," [J. Appl. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4921108) 117(19), 195102 (2015).
- (2015). <sup>34</sup>Y. Wang, Z. Fan, P. Qian, M. A. Caro, and T. Ala-Nissila, "Quantum-corrected thickness-dependent thermal conductivity in amorphous silicon predicted by machine learning molecular dynamics simulations," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.107.054303) 107(5), 054303 (2023).
- 054303 (2023). <sup>35</sup>W. Lv and A. Henry, "Direct calculation of modal contributions to thermal conductivity via Green–Kubo modal analysis," [New J. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1367-2630/18/1/013028) 18(1), 013028 (2016).
- <sup>36</sup>K. Sääskilahti, J. Oksanen, J. Tulkki, A. J. H. McGaughey, and S. Volz, "Vibrational mean free paths and thermal conductivity of amorphous silicon from non-equilibrium molecular dynamics simulations," [AIP Adv.](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4968617) 6(12), 121904 (2016).
- <sup>37</sup>W. Sha, X. Dai, S. Chen, B. Yin, and F. Guo, "Phonon thermal transport in two-dimensional PbTe monolayers via extensive molecular dynamics simula-
- tions with a neuroevolution potential," [Mater. Today Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mtphys.2023.101066) **34**, 101066 (2023).  $^{38}$ K. Xu, Y. Hao, T. Liang, P. Ying, J. Xu, J. Wu, and Z. Fan, "Accurate prediction of heat conductivity of water by a neuroevolution potential," [J. Chem. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0147039)
- 158(20), 204114 (2023).  $39Y$ . Zhou, "Assessing the quantum effect in classical thermal conductivity of
- amorphous silicon," [J. Appl. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0054039) <sup>129</sup>(23), 235104 (2021). <sup>40</sup>G. Barbalinardo, Z. Chen, H. Dong, Z. Fan, and D. Donadio, "Ultrahigh convergent thermal conductivity of carbon nanotubes from comprehensive atomistic modeling," Phys. Rev. Lett. 127(2), 025902 (2021).
- <sup>41</sup>S.-I. Tamura, "Isotope scattering of dispersive phonons in Ge," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.27.858)
- 27(2), 858–866 (1983).  $42T$ . Feng, L. Lindsay, and X. Ruan, "Four-phonon scattering significantly reduces intrinsic thermal conductivity of solids," [Phys. Rev. B](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.96.161201) 96(16), 161201 (2017).